

June 2, 2019

Dear Gillian Aitken CB,

We are members of the Forum on Health, Environment and Development (FORHEAD) and are also professors or senior research fellows from different universities and research institutions located in different Provinces/Municipalities of China.

We knew about the research misconduct of Professor Lora-Wainwright (some of us are the direct victims of her misconduct) and we fully support the complaint sent to the University of Oxford by Dr. Holdaway and Professor Wang on behalf of FORHEAD.

On March 18th, 2019, each of us received an email letter from you that informed us the result of investigation on Professor Lora-Wainwright's research misconduct and the decision that the University of Oxford made to redress the misconduct. We noticed that the investigation concluded that "Professor Lora-Wainwright was responsible for serious research misconduct, because she used the work of others without acknowledgment, and incorrectly represented the involvement of other researchers in the research projects in *Resigned Activism*." However, we are astonished to read that the action taken by the University of Oxford is only "I have therefore written to the editor of the book at MIT Press, to tell her about the investigation, and to ask her to amend the online version of the book, with Professor Lora-Wainwright, to give appropriate recognition of the work of her research colleagues, and to correct errors of fact. Professor Lora-Wainwright will update Diana Hulin in my office on progress in amending the book."

We strongly feel that the action taken by the University of Oxford to redress the research misconduct by Professor Lora-Wainwright does not match "The serious research misconduct," and is unfair to those Chinese scholars whose rights were violated by this serious misconduct. This will have a very bad impact on Chinese academic community, and thus is totally unacceptable. We do not think Professor Lora-Wainwright's behavior is unintended, as a PhD holder and Professor in the University of Oxford, Anna Lora-Wainwright should know very well about how to cite references correctly and avoid plagiarism, no matter if the language of the research is Chinese or English. We think the University of Oxford cannot excuse Anna Lora-Wainwright because the research she used without acknowledgment is Chinese scholars' work.

We thought that the University of Oxford, as a famous and prestigious first class university in UK and even in the world, should have the most strict academic discipline, and at least sound, or even the highest ethical standards in research. However, this redressing action makes us rethink about Oxford University and forces us to think about the underlying cause. Is this because the victims of this misconduct are Chinese scholars or scholars from developing countries? Is it because we did not make our voice heard? Or is it just that Oxford University has its own very different standards of academic ethics?

Therefore we are collectively writing to you to express our views on this serious research misconduct:

1. We see no reason to keep this “serious research misconduct” confidential. To the contrary, we think it is important to make the truth widely available in both international and Chinese academic communities so as to make researchers reflect and draw lessons from the misconduct.
2. Professor Lora-Wainwright’s behavior seriously hurt the Chinese scholars who had close collaboration with her in the case studies written in the book. However, there has been not a single word of apology from her so far. We thus require the University of Oxford to urge Professor Lora-Wainwright to make a formal, public apology to those Chinese scholars.
3. It is inadequate to just ask Professor Lora-Wainwright to amend the online version of the book. The appropriation of the work of other researchers and errors are very serious in the whole book (for evidence, please see the complaint and the attachment of this letter). This is plagiarism and small changes are not enough to fix it. And also, readers will be confused by the two different versions of the same book. We therefore will require MIT Press to withdraw the book and make explanation to readers.
4. The University of Oxford should insist that Anna Lora-Wainwright makes an open apology to Chinese scholars who are victims of her misconduct. And Oxford University should take away the rewards and position that Anna Lora-Wainwright received based on the book “Resigned Activism”.

Finally, we want to express that we also reserve the right to make further complaints, including legal action against this serious research misconduct.

We believe transparency is an important part of research ethics and we do not regard this or any past or future communication with the University of Oxford about this problem as confidential.

Members of FORHEAD

Wuyi Wang



Professor

Institute of Geographic Sciences and Natural Resources Research,
Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China

11A Datun Road, Beijing 100101, China

Tel.: 86 10 64889060

Fax.: 86 10 64856504

Email: wangwy@igsnrr.ac.cn

Jing Fang



Professor PhD

Institute for Health Sciences, Kunming Medical University
1168# Chun Rong Xi Lu, Yuhua Jiedao, Cheng Gong Xinqu
Kunming City, 650500, Yunnan Province, P.R. China

Tel: 86 871 65922941

Mobile phone: 13888580157

Fax: 86 871 65922940

Email: fangjing07@126.com

Shiqiu Zhang



Professor

College of Environmental Sciences and Engineering (CESE)
Institute of Environment and Economy (IoEE) Peking University, Beijing, China

Room 401 Environment Building, College of Environmental Sciences and
Engineering, Peking University, Beijing, 100871, China

Phone: 86-10-62764974

E-mail: zhangshq@pku.edu.cn zhangshiqiu@vip.sina.com

Ajiang Chen



Professor PhD

Director, Department of Sociology, School of Public Administration
Hohai University, No.1 Xikang Road, Nanjing 210098, China

Tel.: 86-25-83786381

Fax.: 86-25-83712612

Email: ajchen@vip.163.com

Liping Li



Profess Ph.D

Director, MPH Education Center and Injury Preventive Research Center
Shantou University Medical College

22 Xinling Road, Shantou 515041, China

Tel.:86-754-88900467 (Office), 86-13825883963 (Mobile)

Email: lpli@stu.edu.cn

Appendix

Evidence of Anna Lora Wainwright's appropriation of the work of other scholars

In the complaint to the University of Oxford, Dr Holdaway and Professor Wang presented evidence that Anna Lora Wainwright used the work of several Chinese scholars without acknowledgment.

The University of Oxford investigation found that this allegation was true and that ALW is guilty of serious misconduct.

Because Oxford University did not take appropriate action and tell MIT Press to withdraw the book, we used plagiarism-detecting software to check Resigned Activism in more detail.

We found that 44% of Chapter 2 of Resigned Activism is exactly the same language as the co-authored chapter in the Wiley Blackwell Handbook of Environmental Health. All the case studies in Chapter 2 are also only summaries of material from Chen Ajiang's book "Cancer Village Research." The other three case studies are also just summaries of from Chen's book. But ALW removed Chen Ajiang's name. This is a violation of intellectual property.

This and other problems in Resigned Activism are very serious and cannot be solved by minor revisions to the online version of the book.